SUBSTITUTE FOR

SENATE BILL NO. 1039

A bill to amend 1973 PA 186, entitled "Tax tribunal act,"

by amending sections 21, 35a, 36, 49, and 62 (MCL 205.721, 205.735a, 205.736, 205.749, and 205.762), section 35a as amended by 2008 PA 125, section 49 as amended by 2008 PA 126, and section 62 as amended by 2008 PA 128.

THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF MICHIGAN ENACT:

- 1 Sec. 21. (1) The tax tribunal is created and is a quasi-
- 2 judicial agency which, for administrative purposes only, is in the
- 3 department of treasury.LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS.
- 4 (2) The tribunal consists of 7 members appointed by the
- 5 governor, with the advice and consent of the senate, for terms of 4
- 6 years. The 2 additional members first appointed by this amendatory

- 1 act shall first serve for 3 years.
- 2 (3) A MEMBER APPOINTED BY A GOVERNOR IS SUBJECT TO REMOVAL
- 3 DURING HIS OR HER TERM BY THAT SAME GOVERNOR FOR CAUSE AFTER NOTICE
- 4 AND HEARING.
- 5 (4) A MEMBER APPOINTED BY A GOVERNOR NOT CURRENTLY IN OFFICE
- 6 IS SUBJECT TO REMOVAL DURING HIS OR HER TERM AS PROVIDED IN SECTION
- 7 10 OF ARTICLE V OF THE STATE CONSTITUTION OF 1963.
- 8 (5) A member may be reappointed and a vacancy shall be filled
- 9 for an unexpired term in the same manner as the appointment is made
- 10 for a full term.
- 11 (6) MEMBERS SHALL UNDERGO ANNUAL TRAINING ON PROPER COURTROOM
- 12 PROCEDURE.
- Sec. 35a. (1) The provisions of this section apply to a
- 14 proceeding before the tribunal that is commenced after December 31,
- **15** 2006.
- 16 (2) A proceeding before the tribunal is original and
- independent and is considered de novo.
- 18 (3) Except as otherwise provided in this section or by law,
- 19 for an assessment dispute as to the valuation or exemption of
- 20 property, the assessment must be protested before the board of
- 21 review before the tribunal acquires jurisdiction of the dispute
- 22 under subsection $\frac{(6)}{(10)}$. FOR A DISPUTE AS TO THE CLASSIFICATION
- 23 OF PROPERTY UNDER SECTION 34C OF THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893
- 24 PA 206, MCL 211.34C, EXCEPT FOR PROPERTY CLASSIFIED AS COMMERCIAL
- 25 REAL PROPERTY, INDUSTRIAL REAL PROPERTY, OR DEVELOPMENTAL REAL
- 26 PROPERTY, THE CLASSIFICATION MUST BE PROTESTED BEFORE THE BOARD OF
- 27 REVIEW AND THE STATE TAX COMMISSION AS PROVIDED IN SECTION 34C OF

- 1 THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.34C, BEFORE THE
- 2 TRIBUNAL ACQUIRES JURISDICTION OF THE DISPUTE UNDER SUBSECTION
- 3 (11). FOR A DISPUTE AS TO THE CLASSIFICATION OF PROPERTY CLASSIFIED
- 4 AS COMMERCIAL REAL PROPERTY, INDUSTRIAL REAL PROPERTY, OR
- 5 DEVELOPMENTAL REAL PROPERTY UNDER SECTION 34C OF THE GENERAL
- 6 PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.34C, THE CLASSIFICATION MAY
- 7 BE PROTESTED BY THE TAXPAYER BEFORE THE BOARD OF REVIEW OR APPEALED
- 8 DIRECTLY TO THE STATE TAX COMMISSION WITHOUT PROTEST BEFORE THE
- 9 BOARD OF REVIEW BEFORE THE TRIBUNAL ACQUIRES JURISDICTION OF THE
- 10 DISPUTE UNDER SUBSECTION (11).
- 11 (4) In the 2007 tax year and each tax year after 2007, all of
- 12 the following apply:
- 13 (a) For an assessment dispute as to the valuation or exemption
- 14 of property classified under section 34c of the general property
- 15 tax act, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.34c, as commercial real property,
- 16 industrial real property, or developmental real property, the
- 17 assessment may be protested before the board of review or appealed
- 18 directly to the tribunal without protest before the board of review
- 19 as provided in subsection (6). (10).
- 20 (b) For an assessment dispute as to the valuation or exemption
- 21 of property classified under section 34c of the general property
- 22 tax act, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.34c, as commercial personal property,
- 23 industrial personal property, or utility personal property, the
- 24 assessment may be protested before the board of review or appealed
- 25 directly to the tribunal without protest before the board of review
- 26 as provided in subsection $\frac{(6)}{(6)}$, if a statement of assessable
- 27 property is filed under section 19 of the general property tax act,

- 1 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.19, prior to the commencement of the board of
- 2 review for the tax year involved.
- 3 (c) For an assessment dispute as to the valuation of property
- 4 that is subject to taxation under 1974 PA 198, MCL 207.551 to
- 5 207.572, the commercial redevelopment act, 1978 PA 255, MCL 207.651
- 6 to 207.668, the enterprise zone act, 1985 PA 224, MCL 125.2101 to
- 7 125.2123, the technology park development act, 1984 PA 385, MCL
- 8 207.701 to 207.718, the obsolete property rehabilitation act, 2000
- **9** PA 146, MCL 125.2781 to 125.2797, the commercial rehabilitation
- 10 act, 2005 PA 210, MCL 207.841 to 207.856, or 1953 PA 189, MCL
- 11 211.181 to 211.182, the assessment may be protested before the
- 12 board of review or appealed directly to the tribunal without
- 13 protest before the board of review as provided in subsection $\frac{(6)}{}$.
- 14 (10). This subdivision does not apply to property that is subject
- 15 to the neighborhood enterprise zone act, 1992 PA 147, MCL 207.771
- **16** to 207.786.
- 17 (5) For a A dispute regarding a determination of a claim of
- 18 exemption of a principal residence or qualified agricultural
- 19 property for a year in which the July or December board of review
- 20 has authority to determine a claim of exemption for a principal
- 21 residence or qualified agricultural property, the claim of
- 22 exemption shall be presented to either the July or December board
- 23 of review before the tribunal acquires jurisdiction of the dispute.
- 24 SHALL BE APPEALED DIRECTLY TO THE TRIBUNAL WITHOUT PROTEST BEFORE
- 25 THE BOARD OF REVIEW. For a special assessment dispute, the special
- 26 assessment shall be protested at the hearing held for the purpose
- 27 of confirming the special assessment roll before the tribunal

- 1 acquires jurisdiction of the dispute.
- 2 (6) FOR A DISPUTE REGARDING A DETERMINATION OF A CLAIM OF
- 3 EXEMPTION OF A PRINCIPAL RESIDENCE BY REASON OF POVERTY UNDER
- 4 SECTION 7U OF THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA 206, MCL
- 5 211.7U, THE CLAIM OF EXEMPTION SHALL BE PRESENTED TO THE MARCH,
- 6 JULY, OR DECEMBER BOARD OF REVIEW BEFORE THE TRIBUNAL ACQUIRES
- 7 JURISDICTION OF THE DISPUTE.
- 8 (7) FOR A DISPUTE REGARDING A DETERMINATION OF A CLAIM OF
- 9 EXEMPTION OF THE HOMESTEAD OF A DISABLED VETERAN OR THE UNREMARRIED
- 10 SURVIVING SPOUSE OF A DISABLED VETERAN UNDER SECTION 7B OF THE
- 11 GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.7B, THE CLAIM OF
- 12 EXEMPTION SHALL BE PRESENTED TO THE MARCH, JULY, OR DECEMBER BOARD
- 13 OF REVIEW BEFORE THE TRIBUNAL ACQUIRES JURISDICTION OF THE DISPUTE.
- 14 (8) FOR A DISPUTE REGARDING A DETERMINATION OF A CLAIM OF A
- 15 QUALIFIED ERROR UNDER SECTION 53E OF THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT,
- 16 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.53E, THE CLAIM OF EXEMPTION SHALL BE PRESENTED
- 17 TO THE STATE TAX COMMISSION BEFORE THE TRIBUNAL ACQUIRES
- 18 JURISDICTION OF THE DISPUTE.
- 19 (9) FOR A DISPUTE REGARDING A DETERMINATION OF A CLAIM OF
- 20 EXEMPTION OF QUALIFIED AGRICULTURAL PROPERTY UNDER SECTION 7EE OF
- 21 THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.7EE, THE CLAIM
- 22 OF EXEMPTION SHALL BE APPEALED DIRECTLY TO THE TRIBUNAL WITHOUT
- 23 PROTEST BEFORE THE BOARD OF REVIEW.
- 24 (10) (6) The jurisdiction of the tribunal in an assessment
- 25 dispute as to property classified under section 34c of the general
- 26 property tax act, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.34c, as commercial real
- 27 property, industrial real property, developmental real property,

- 1 commercial personal property, industrial personal property, or
- 2 utility personal property is invoked by a party in interest, as
- 3 petitioner, filing a written petition on or before May JULY 31 of
- 4 the tax year involved. The jurisdiction of the tribunal in an
- 5 assessment dispute as to property classified under section 34c of
- 6 the general property tax act, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.34c, as
- 7 agricultural real property, residential real property, timber-
- 8 cutover real property, or agricultural personal property is invoked
- 9 by a party in interest, as petitioner, filing a written petition on
- 10 or before July 31 of the tax year involved. THE JURISDICTION OF THE
- 11 TRIBUNAL IN AN ASSESSMENT DISPUTE AS TO PROPERTY SUBJECT TO AN
- 12 ORDER ISSUED BY THE STATE TAX COMMISSION UNDER SECTION 154(1) OF
- 13 THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.154, IS INVOKED
- 14 BY A PARTY IN INTEREST, AS PETITIONER, FILING A WRITTEN PETITION
- 15 WITHIN 60 DAYS AFTER THAT ORDER IS ISSUED. In all other matters,
- 16 EXCEPT AS OTHERWISE PROVIDED IN THIS SECTION, the jurisdiction of
- 17 the tribunal is invoked by a party in interest, as petitioner,
- 18 filing a written petition within 35-60 days after the final
- 19 decision, ruling, or determination. THE JURISDICTION OF THE
- 20 TRIBUNAL IN A DISPUTE REGARDING A DETERMINATION OF A CLAIM OF
- 21 EXEMPTION OF A PRINCIPAL RESIDENCE BY REASON OF POVERTY UNDER
- 22 SECTION 7U OF THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA 206, MCL
- 23 211.7U, IS INVOKED BY THE PERSON CLAIMING THE EXEMPTION, AS
- 24 PETITIONER, FILING A WRITTEN PETITION BY JULY 31 IF THE CLAIM OF
- 25 EXEMPTION WAS DENIED BY THE MARCH BOARD OF REVIEW OR WITHIN 60 DAYS
- 26 AFTER THE JULY OR DECEMBER BOARD OF REVIEW DENIED THE CLAIM FOR
- 27 EXEMPTION. THE JURISDICTION OF THE TRIBUNAL IN A DISPUTE REGARDING

- 1 A DETERMINATION OF A CLAIM OF EXEMPTION OF THE HOMESTEAD OF A
- 2 DISABLED VETERAN OR THE UNREMARRIED SURVIVING SPOUSE OF A DISABLED
- 3 VETERAN UNDER SECTION 7B OF THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA
- 4 206, MCL 211.7B, IS INVOKED BY THE PERSON CLAIMING THE EXEMPTION,
- 5 AS PETITIONER, FILING A WRITTEN PETITION BY JULY 31 IF THE CLAIM OF
- 6 EXEMPTION WAS DENIED BY THE MARCH BOARD OF REVIEW OR WITHIN 60 DAYS
- 7 AFTER THE JULY OR DECEMBER BOARD OF REVIEW DENIED THE CLAIM FOR
- 8 EXEMPTION. THE JURISDICTION OF THE TRIBUNAL IN A DISPUTE REGARDING
- 9 A DETERMINATION OF A CLAIM OF A QUALIFIED ERROR UNDER SECTION 53E
- 10 OF THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.53E, IS
- 11 INVOKED BY THE TAXPAYER OR ASSESSING OFFICER FILING A WRITTEN
- 12 PETITION WITHIN 60 DAYS AFTER THE DECISION OF THE STATE TAX
- 13 COMMISSION. THE JURISDICTION OF THE TRIBUNAL IN A DISPUTE REGARDING
- 14 A DETERMINATION OF A CLAIM OF EXEMPTION OF QUALIFIED AGRICULTURAL
- 15 PROPERTY UNDER SECTION 7EE OF THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA
- 16 206, MCL 211.7EE, IS INVOKED BY THE PERSON CLAIMING THE EXEMPTION,
- 17 AS PETITIONER, FILING A WRITTEN PETITION WITHIN 60 DAYS OF THE
- 18 DENIAL OR MODIFICATION OF THE EXEMPTION. An appeal of a contested
- 19 tax bill shall be made within 60 days after mailing by the
- 20 assessment district treasurer and the appeal is limited solely to
- 21 correcting arithmetic errors or mistakes and is not a basis of
- 22 appeal as to disputes of valuation of the property, the property's
- 23 exempt status, or the property's equalized value resulting from
- 24 equalization of its assessment by the county board of commissioners
- 25 or the state tax commission. Service of the petition on the
- 26 respondent shall be by certified mail. For an assessment dispute,
- 27 service of the petition shall be mailed to the assessor of that

- 1 local tax collecting unit if the respondent is the local tax
- 2 collecting unit. Except for petitions filed under chapter 6, a copy
- 3 of the petition shall also be sent to the secretary of the school
- 4 board in the local school district in which the property is located
- 5 and to the clerk of any county that may be affected.
- 6 (11) THE JURISDICTION OF THE TRIBUNAL IN A DISPUTE AS TO THE
- 7 CLASSIFICATION OF PROPERTY UNDER SECTION 34C OF THE GENERAL
- 8 PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.34C, IS INVOKED BY AN OWNER
- 9 OR AN ASSESSOR, AS PETITIONER, FILING A WRITTEN PETITION WITHIN THE
- 10 TIME FRAME PRESCRIBED IN SECTION 34C OF THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX
- 11 ACT, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.34C. AN APPEAL AS TO THE CLASSIFICATION
- 12 OF PROPERTY UNDER SECTION 34C OF THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893
- 13 PA 206, MCL 211.34C, MAY INCLUDE THE YEAR IN WHICH THE PETITION IS
- 14 FILED ONLY. SERVICE OF THE PETITION ON THE RESPONDENT SHALL BE BY
- 15 CERTIFIED MAIL. SERVICE OF THE PETITION SHALL BE MAILED TO THE
- 16 ASSESSOR OF THAT LOCAL TAX COLLECTING UNIT IF THE RESPONDENT IS THE
- 17 LOCAL TAX COLLECTING UNIT. A COPY OF THE PETITION SHALL ALSO BE
- 18 SENT TO THE SECRETARY OF THE SCHOOL BOARD IN THE LOCAL SCHOOL
- 19 DISTRICT IN WHICH THE PROPERTY IS LOCATED, TO THE CLERK OF ANY
- 20 COUNTY THAT MAY BE AFFECTED, AND TO THE STATE TREASURER.
- 21 (12) (7)—A petition is considered filed on or before the
- 22 expiration of the time period provided in this section or by law if
- 23 1 or more of the following occur:
- 24 (a) The petition is postmarked by the United States postal
- 25 service on or before the expiration of that time period.
- 26 (b) The petition is delivered in person on or before the
- 27 expiration of that time period.

- 1 (c) The petition is given to a designated delivery service for
- 2 delivery on or before the expiration of that time period and the
- 3 petition is delivered by that designated delivery service or, if
- 4 the petition is not delivered by that designated delivery service,
- 5 the petitioner establishes that the petition was given to that
- 6 designated delivery service for delivery on or before the
- 7 expiration of that time period.
- 8 (13) (8) A petition required to be filed by a day during which
- 9 the offices of the tribunal are not open for business shall be
- 10 filed by the next business day.
- 11 (14) (9)—A petition or answer may be amended at any time by
- 12 leave of the tribunal and in compliance with its rules. If a tax
- 13 was paid while the determination of the right to the tax is pending
- 14 before the tribunal, the taxpayer may amend his or her petition to
- 15 seek a refund of that tax.
- 16 (15) (10) A person or legal entity may appear before the
- 17 tribunal in his or her own behalf or may be represented by an
- 18 attorney or by any other person.
- 19 (16) (11) As used in this section, "designated delivery
- 20 service" means a delivery service provided by a trade or business
- 21 that is designated by the tribunal for purposes of this subsection.
- 22 The tribunal shall issue a tribunal notice not later than December
- 23 31 in each calendar year designating not less than 1 delivery
- 24 service for the immediately succeeding calendar year. The tribunal
- 25 may designate a delivery service only if the tribunal determines
- 26 that the delivery service meets all of the following requirements:
- 27 (a) Is available to the general public.

- 1 (b) Is at least as timely and reliable on a regular basis as
- 2 the United States postal service.
- 3 (c) Records electronically to a database kept in the regular
- 4 course of business or marks on the petition the date on which the
- 5 petition was given to the delivery service for delivery.
- 6 (d) Any other requirement the tribunal prescribes.
- 7 Sec. 36. (1) Tribunal, THE TRIBUNAL, upon written request of a
- 8 party to a proceeding, shall issue subpoenas forthwith requiring
- 9 the attendance and testimony of witnesses and the production of
- 10 evidence, including, but not limited to, books, records,
- 11 correspondence, and documents in their possession or under their
- 12 control, UNLESS THE REQUEST IS UNREASONABLE OR OPPRESSIVE. On
- 13 written request, the tribunal shall revoke a subpoena if the
- 14 TESTIMONY TO BE PROVIDED AND THE evidence , the production of which
- 15 is required, does TO BE PRODUCED DO not relate to a matter in issue
- 16 , or if the subpoena does not describe with sufficient
- 17 particularity the evidence, the production of which is required, or
- 18 if for any other reason sufficient in law. the subpoena is invalid.
- 19 In case of refusal to comply with a subpoena, the party on whose
- 20 behalf it was issued may file a petition, in the circuit court for
- 21 Ingham county or for the county in which the proceeding is held,
- 22 for an order requiring compliance.
- 23 (2) When directed by the chairman, a state or local
- 24 governmental unit or agency shall make available books, records,
- 25 documents, information, and assistance to the tribunal.
- 26 Sec. 49. (1) The tribunal by rule shall prescribe filing fees
- 27 and other fees to be paid in connection with a proceeding before

- 1 the tribunal. The fees shall be paid to the clerk of the tribunal
- 2 and by order of the tribunal may be taxed as costs.
- 3 (2) The residential property and small claims division of the
- 4 tribunal shall not charge fees or costs on appeals FOR ANY OF THE
- 5 FOLLOWING:
- 6 (A) APPEALS RELATING TO THE VALUATION of principal residence
- 7 property as defined in rules promulgated by the tax tribunal.
- 8 (B) APPEALS RELATING TO A CLAIM FOR EXEMPTION BY REASON OF
- 9 POVERTY UNDER SECTION 7U OF THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA
- 10 206, MCL 211.7U.
- 11 (3) The Michigan tax tribunal fund is created in the
- 12 department of labor and economic growth LICENSING AND REGULATORY
- 13 AFFAIRS as a separate interest bearing fund. All fees collected
- 14 pursuant to this act shall be deposited in the Michigan tax
- 15 tribunal fund. The state treasurer shall direct the investment of
- 16 the Michigan tax tribunal fund. Money in the Michigan tax tribunal
- 17 fund shall remain in the Michigan tax tribunal fund at the close of
- 18 the fiscal year and shall not revert to the general fund. Money in
- 19 the Michigan tax tribunal fund shall be used solely for operation
- 20 of the tribunal.
- 21 Sec. 62. (1) The residential property and small claims
- 22 division created in section 61 has jurisdiction over a proceeding,
- 23 otherwise cognizable by the tribunal, in which residential property
- 24 is exclusively involved. Property other than residential property
- 25 may be included in a proceeding before the residential property and
- 26 small claims division if the amount of that property's taxable
- 27 value or state equalized valuation in dispute is not more than

- 1 \$100,000.00.\$150,000.00, ADJUSTED ANNUALLY BY THE INFLATION RATE.
- 2 The residential property and small claims division also has
- 3 jurisdiction over a proceeding involving an appeal of any other tax
- 4 over which the tribunal has jurisdiction if the amount of the tax
- 5 in dispute is $\frac{$20,000.00}{75,000.00}$ or less, adjusted annually by
- 6 the inflation rate. As used in this subsection, "inflation rate"
- 7 means the ratio of the general price level for the state fiscal
- 8 year ending in the calendar year immediately preceding the current
- 9 year divided by the general price level for the state fiscal year
- 10 ending in the calendar year before the year immediately preceding
- 11 the current year.
- 12 (2) A person or legal entity entitled to proceed under section
- 13 31, and whose proceeding meets the jurisdictional requirements of
- 14 subsection (1), may elect to proceed before either the residential
- 15 property and small claims division or the entire tribunal. A formal
- 16 record of residential property and small claims division
- 17 proceedings is not required. Within 20 days after a hearing officer
- 18 or referee issues a proposed order, a party may file exceptions to
- 19 the proposed order. The tribunal shall review the exceptions to
- 20 determine if the proposed order shall be adopted as a final order.
- 21 Upon a showing of good cause or at the tribunal's discretion, the
- 22 tribunal may modify the proposed order and issue a final order or
- 23 hold a rehearing by a tribunal member. A rehearing is not limited
- 24 to the evidence presented before the hearing officer or referee.
- 25 (3) Except as otherwise provided in this subsection, the
- 26 residential property and small claims division shall meet in the
- 27 county in which the property in question is located or in a county

- 1 contiguous to the county in which the property in question is
- 2 located. A petitioner-appellant shall not be required to travel
- 3 more than 100 miles from the location of the property in question
- 4 to the hearing site, except that a rehearing by a tribunal member
- 5 shall be at a site determined by the tribunal. By leave of the
- 6 tribunal and with the mutual consent of all parties, a residential
- 7 property and small claims division proceeding may take place at a
- 8 location mutually agreed upon by all parties or may take place by
- 9 the use of amplified telephonic or video conferencing equipment.
- 10 (4) The tribunal shall make a short form for the simplified
- 11 filing of residential property and small claims appeals.
- 12 (5) In a proceeding before the residential property and small
- 13 claims division for property other than residential property, if
- 14 the amount of taxable value or state equalized valuation in dispute
- is greater than \$20,000.00, or in nonproperty matters if the amount
- in dispute is greater than \$1,000.00, the filing fee is the amount
- 17 that would have been paid if the proceeding was brought before the
- 18 entire tribunal and not the residential property and small claims
- 19 division.
- 20 (6) As used in this chapter, "residential property" means any
- 21 of the following:
- 22 (a) Real property exempt under section 7cc of the general
- 23 property tax act, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.7cc.
- 24 (b) Real property classified as residential real property
- 25 under section 34c of the general property tax act, 1893 PA 206, MCL
- **26** 211.34c.
- (c) Real property with less than 4 rental units.

- (d) Real property classified as agricultural real property 1
- 2 under section 34c of the general property tax act, 1893 PA 206, MCL
- 3 211.34c.
- (E) REAL PROPERTY EXEMPT UNDER SECTION 7EE OF THE GENERAL
- 5 PROPERTY TAX ACT, 1893 PA 206, MCL 211.7EE.
- Enacting section 1. This amendatory act does not take effect 6
- unless Senate Bill No. 1038 of the 97th Legislature is enacted into 7
- 8 law.